

**CAREER EDUCATION PROGRAMS**

| Author/Date                                   | Target Group (Age/Gr) | Intervention Description                   | Length & Fx Of Treatment | Who Provided Treatment | Sample Size | Effect Size |
|---|-----------------------|--|--------------------------|------------------------|-------------|-------------|
| Dunn & Veltman (1989)                         | Youths                | Summer Program Minority                    | Meta Analysis            | N/A                    | 22          | 0.54        |
| Fouad (1995)                                  | 8                     | Minority Awareness                         | Meta Analysis            | N/A                    | 176         | 0.34        |
| Jones (1993)                                  | 11                    | Guidance Instruments                       | Meta Analysis            | N/A                    | 221         | 0.22        |
| Kush & Cochran (1993)                         | 12                    | Parent Agency Support                      | Meta Analysis            | N/A                    | 64          | 0.18        |
| Lapan, Gysbers, Hughs, & Arni (1993)          | 11                    | Career Development and Writing Skills      | Meta Analysis            | N/A                    | 166         | 0.35        |
| Laskin & Palmo (1983)                         | 11                    | Decisions & Maturity                       | Meta Analysis            | N/A                    | 132         | 0.49        |
| Munson (1994)                                 | 8-12                  | Youth Offenders                            | Meta Analysis            | N/A                    | 44          | 0.29        |
| Palmer & Cochran (1988)                       | 10-11                 | Parent Assist Career Planning              | Meta Analysis            | N/A                    | 40          | 0.33        |
| Speight, Rosenthal, Jones & Gastenveld (1995) | 9                     | Medcamp: Problem-Based Career Intervention | Meta Analysis            | N/A                    | 45          | 0.99        |
| Taymans, Lewis, & Ramsay (1990)               | 14+                   | Real Life Summer Career Education          | Meta Analysis            | N/A                    | 40          | 0.35        |
| Van Buren, Kelly, & Hall (1993)               | 17                    | Video Tape Non-Tradition Careers           | Meta Analysis            | N/A                    | 986         | 0.05        |
| Weeks & Porter (1983)                         | 11                    | Non-Tradition Role Models                  | Meta Analysis            | N/A                    | 48          | -0.05       |

| Author & Date            | Legum & Hoare (2004)   | Barnes & Herr (1998)  | Whitaker, Phillips, & Tokar (2004)   | McCarthy, Moller, & Beard (2003)  |
|--------------------------|--|---|--|---|
| Target Group             | At-Risk Middle School Students (6 <sup>th</sup> & 7 <sup>th</sup> )                                    | College Students who Scored Low on the SCD and Requested Counseling   | Undergraduate College Students Receiving Extra Credit (Simulating Actual Clients)                | Graduate Counseling Students W/ Undergrad Volunteers  |
| Intervention Description | <i>Career Targets</i> (Durgin, 1998) Career Counseling Exploring Occupations with High School Planning | Individual Career Counseling or Combined with Either SII or DISCOVER Computer Program                       | Simulated First Counseling Session Viewed In a 9-min Video About Client and Counselor Expectancy | Meet client to conduct career interview and then follow-up With Internet Resource Search in Computer Lab Together |
| Length & Fx Of Treatment | Nine Weeks Once per Week   | Five Weeks Once per Week  | Two Weeks<br>Wk1 = Assess<br>Wk2 = Video & Assessment  | Two Sessions<br>30 Minutes Each   |
| Sample Size              | (N = 57)   | (N = 110)   | (N = 168)  | (N = 14)  |
| Who Provided Treatment   | Study's Researchers and a College Professor  | Counselors in University Career Center  | Study's Researchers  | Graduate Counseling Students  |
| Measures                 | 1995 Crites Career Maturity Inventory, Coopersmith Self-Esteem Inventory, and Grade Point Averages     | Strong Interest Inventory, Survey of Career Development, Career Decision Scale, and My Vocational Situation | Expectations About Counseling – Brief Form and Attitudes Toward Counseling Scale                 | Life Career Assessment Interview and the Internet Barriers Questionnaire  |
| Results                  | Not Statistically Significant, But were Qualitatively from Teacher Interviews                          | Positive increases shown by all, but combined interventions no more successful than counseling alone.       | Significant Increase in Personal Commitment And decreased Expectation in Counselor's Expertise   | Both clients And counselors Found internet Most Useful & Significant Career Knowledge & Information was Gained.   |

### Summary of Key Findings

While reviewing the information in the first table for the studies included in the meta analysis, there is one clear trend that presents itself. If one views the bottom two studies (Van Buren, Kelly, and Hall [1993] and Weeks and Porter [1983]), it is highly evident that the interventions for non-traditional roles were not very successful. The first is listed as having an effect size of 0.05 and the second with -0.05. These are the two lowest scores in the table and they are also the only two related to non-traditional roles. I believe this shows that most people, including children, are not interested in pursuing occupations outside of what is generally considered acceptable for their specific gender.

As further support of this finding, the earlier meta analysis presented in this research article also included one study measuring an intervention related to non-traditional role models. Once again, the effect size was only -0.01. Thus, I find that it is empirically supported that students wish to learn about and pursue careers that are not contradictory to their personal views on gender roles in society. This information should prove to be particularly useful in my future duties working as a school counselor.

In the article by Legum and Hoare (2004), it was found that middle school students could benefit from career-related interventions at that age. Behaviors and work improvements were noted qualitatively by their respective teachers. However, the authors do note that statistically the results were not significant, but they attribute that to the short duration of the intervention. Being younger, they believe that these less mature minds need more time to learn and process the applicable materials. Plus, with these students being “at-risk”, it is assumed that they have met with previous barriers to their goals. It is recommended to begin the career exploration process in elementary school.

In referring to the article by Barnes and Herr (1998), the authors were looking to study the resultant effects of combining two interventions. This was to be compared to the findings of using one of the interventions by itself. All three treatment groups had positive effects on career indecisiveness and academic goals. However, it was not found to be any more beneficial to combine individual counseling with any type of assessment inventory. The authors conclude that counseling alone is the most effective intervention in terms of amount of gain per hour of effort.

As for the article written by Whitaker, Phillips, and Tokar (2004), it was desired to find a way to change client expectations when seeking out career counseling. Generally speaking, clients tend to have low commitment levels for the amount of time, effort, and work which they are willing to put forth. They tend to perceive that their counselor(s) will be complete experts in the field and will tell them exactly what they need to do. It was shown in the study that a simple videotape portraying the roles of the counselor and client in a first session dramatically changed the expectations of the clients. Hence, it is quite possible to increase commitment levels and decrease expectations.

McCarthy, Moller, and Beard (2003) were seeking to document the positive effects that are possible by following up counseling sessions with pair work using the internet to find career resource information. Both “clients” and “counselors” found the experience to be productive and beneficial. However, several challenges were faced by: 1) computer aptitude, 2) slow web connections, 3) unorganized information, 4) lack of full counseling sessions, and 5) inability to evaluate the quality of content. It was recommended that both the counselor and client learn more about the internet and experiment with various sources of career information on the web.

### Successful Career Interventions

\*\*\*National Career Development Guidelines\*\*\* <http://www.acrnetwork.org/ncdg.htm>

The National Occupational Information Coordinating Committee (NOICC) first released guidelines in 1989. Much has changed since then and the Guidelines Revision Project was commissioned in 2003. These national guidelines were newly released in the past two months. The project is intended to: 1) prepare youth and adults, 2) reduce individual risks, 3) increase program accountability, 4) promote program coordination, and 5) expand public awareness. Along with this, it is desired to align these with the *No Child Left Behind Act*. The new guidelines target K-12 students and the whole school community, provide easily accessible career development information, and create a robust web site for resource searches.

The guidelines are broken down into three domains: Personal Social Development, Educational Achievement and Lifelong Learning, and Career Management. These domains are then broken down into eleven (11) different goals related to career development competency. The goals are highlighted by more than **200 indicators** that detail the knowledge and skills needed to achieve them. Each indicator is presented in **three learning stages** derived from *Bloom's Taxonomy*. The first is *knowledge acquisition*, the second is *application*, and the third being *reflection*.

Recommendations for using these guidelines that apply to counselors are to: 1) find gaps in current programs, 2) craft needs assessments, 3) create a new competency-based career development program, 4) develop a program evaluation and accountability plan, and 5) review materials on hand and those being considered for purchase. It is strongly suggested to review the ACRN website in its entirety for career resources.

It can be supported by the documented research that the longer that one is exposed to a career intervention, the greater the likelihood of having stronger positive results – providing that it is a result-producing program. When reviewing the table for the meta analysis, it is shown that the two highest effect sizes were found connected to programs that were the most time-intensive. In the Dun and Veltman (1989) study, the youths were exposed over the course of a summer. Knowing it was this time of year, they also did not have to contend with any of their academic classes to distract them (ES = 0.54). When looking at the research conducted by Speight, Rosenthal, Jones, and Gastenveld (1995), the students were subjected to an intensive three day camp program. They were focused on the intervention itself and not participating in school activities (ES = 0.99).

This information would support what was found or recommended in two of the other studies considered. Legum and Hoare (2004) felt that results and positive impact would have been much stronger had the young, at-risk sample been able to meet more frequently and also participate in more sessions. Along with this, the participants in the McCarthy, Moller, and Beard (2003) study self-reported that they felt that it would have been greatly beneficial to have more time to both plan and to consult during intervention. Brigman (2005) has repeatedly stated the positive effects of having more sessions.

The most productive intervention of those reviewed was that employed in the study conducted by Whitaker, Phillips, and Tokar (2004). An initial counseling session was role-played by actors who were performing in desired fashion. Once students/clients were able to see what was expected of them, they then completely overhauled their misconceived perceptions of what the counseling process would entail. As a result, the shift of responsibility went from the counselor to the client; who needs to help himself.

### References

- Baker, S. B. & Taylor J. G. (1998). Effects of career education interventions: A meta-analysis. *The Career Development Quarterly*, 46(4), 376 – 383.
- Barnes, J. A. & Herr, E. L. (1998). The effects of interventions on career progress. *Journal of Career Development*, 24(3), 179 – 192.
- Legum, H. L. & Hoare, C. H. (2004). Impact of a career intervention on at-risk middle school students' career maturity levels, academic achievement, and self-esteem. *Professional School Counseling*, 8(2), 148 – 155.
- McCarthy, C. J., Moller, N., & Beard, L. M. (2003). Suggestions for training students using the internet for career counseling. *The Career Development Quarterly*, 51, 368 – 380.
- National Career Development Association (2005). *National Career Development Guidelines*. Retrieved from <http://www.acrnetwork.org/ncdg.htm>
- Whitaker, L. A., Phillips, J. C., & Tokar, D. M. (2004). Influencing client expectations about career counseling using a videotaped intervention. *The Career Development Quarterly*, 52, 309 – 318.